

2005 DEC -9 ANIC: 11

BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. 333 Commerce Street Suite 2101 Nashville, TN 37201-3300

Guv M Hicks General Counsel T.R.A. DOCKET ROOM

615 214 6301 Fax 615 214 7406

guy hicks@bellsouth.com

December 9, 2005

## VIA HAND DELIVERY

Hon, Ron Jones, Chairman Tennessee Regulatory Authority 460 James Robertson Parkway Nashville, TN 37238

> Petition for Arbitration of ITC^DeltaCom Communications, Inc. Re: with BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. Pursuant to the

Telecommunications Act of 1996

Docket No. 03-00119

## Dear Chairman Jones:

BellSouth files this letter in response to the December 8, 2005, filing on behalf of ITC DeltaCom in Docket 03-00119. That letter omits key facts about a November 30, 2005 Maine Court decision ("Maine Decision").

First, the case itself is not a final decision on the merits. It is a decision disposing of a preliminary injunction motion in a docket that remains open and is certain to result in further activity. Second, the case is factually distinguishable because it all relates back to Verizon's wholesale tariff and the Maine Commission's perception that Verizon made a voluntary commitment to file 271 obligations in its wholesale tariff. The district court expressly found that Section 271 "was not intended by the Congress to exclude the PUC in the circumstances of this case from all activity in setting rates under § 271." Maine Decision, p. 16 (emphasis supplied). Moreover, with all due respect to the Maine district court, the case is inconsistent with the three federal district court cases rendered much closer to home in Mississippi and Kentucky, both of which correctly acknowledged that Section 271 explicitly places enforcement authority with the FCC. It is also inconsistent with the court's decision in Montana, which held that Section Hon. Ron Jones, Chairman December 9, 2005 Page 2

252 did not authorize a state commission to approve an agreement containing elements or services that are not mandated by Section 251.

The Maine Decision is also based on faulty reasoning with respect to the relationship between the states and the FCC pursuant to Section 271. Section 271 is not a ratemaking provision; rather it involves applications for certain authority under federal law. Section 271 does not have to include the words "preemption;" state commissions have limited authority under Section 252 to ensure Section 251 compliance. Because section 271 is part of federal law, there is no baseline state authority to preempt -- states only have the authority to implement federal law that Congress gave them, and USTA II has made quite clear the limits on further FCC delegation to the states. Moreover, with respect to Section 271 Congress gave the relevant authority to the FCC and elsewhere expressly limited state authority to section 251 rates.

As to whether section 271 requires TELRIC, the FCC itself explained that the just and reasonable requirement does not mandate TELRIC in the TRO, and that ruling was affirmed on that in USTA II. The Maine district court's attempt to minimize that is unpersuasive. The FCC's decision not to mandate unbundling under 251 for certain UNEs becomes meaningless if states can require the very same unbundling at the very same rates under 271. The result is no different than adding UNEs where the FCC has refused to require unbundling.

Verý truly yours,

Guy M. Hicks

GMH:ch

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on December 9, 2005, a copy of the foregoing

document was served on the parties of record, via the method indicated:	
[ ] Hand	Henry Walker, Esquire
[ ] Mail	Boult, Cummings, et al.
[ ] Facsimile	1600 Division Street, #700
[ ] Overnight	P. O. Box 340025
Electronic	Nashville, TN 37203
	hwalker@boultcummings.com
[ ] Hand	Tony Mastando, Esquire
[ ] Mail	ITC^DeltaCom
[ ] Facsimile	4092 South Memorial Parkway
[ ] Overnight	Huntsville Al 35802

Electronic

[ ] Hand

[ ] Mail

[ ] Facsimile

[ ] Overnight

[ / Electronic

David Adelman, Esquire Charles B. Jones, III, Esquire Sutherland Asbill & Brennan 999 Peachtree Street, NE Atlanta, GA 30309 David.adelman@sablaw.com

tony.mastando@itcdeltacom.com jean.houck@itcdeltacom.com

